

Indicators of teaching effectiveness 2021-2022

A case study was conducted during the current academic year 2022-2023 to measure the effectiveness of trainees in teaching. It assessed the performance of the first program Completers in Qatar University – College of Education for 2021-2022.

Data on teaching effectiveness are only reported. The following is a description of the case study design and outcome.

The study measured the efficiency and satisfaction of students with their teaching effectiveness. It also assessed the students' complete fulfillment of the College of Education programs, the employer and parents' satisfaction with teaching performances. Teaching efficiency data and interviews are documented in this analysis. The case study design and findings are listed below.

The purpose of this case study was to analyze **the impact of the teacher's education system by assessing the output of completers' performances**. The objective of the present case study was to investigate the impact of the teacher preparation program at the College of Education by evaluating the performance of the trainees. The study deals with the following research question on teaching effectiveness:

How completers demonstrate their willingness to apply technical expertise, skills, knowledge and provisions targeted at their preparatory program experience has been design to achieve?

Methodology

Participants

The sampling of this case study included graduate teachers and their staff (i.e., administrators, vice presidents, subject co-coordinators, managers, student teacher mentors and learners' parents). All teachers involved completed the study during the academic year 2021-2022. Participants in this study were female and male, but mainly were female because 95 percent of QU-CED students are females. In this year, the sample consisted of 12 female teachers and 2 male teachers.

Research design

The processing of data was based on mixed-method explanatory research (Creswell & Clark 2017). There have been two data sources, 14 case studies, including interviews of teacher graduates and their subject coordinators as well as a teacher assessment paper and other papers such as curriculum, teaching material and student results, have been performed in relation to data. Only teacher productivity results obtained from observations and interviews are described in this section of the study.

Data Sources:

Fourteen program completers have participated voluntarily in this case study conducted between the second week of January 2023 to the first week of February 2023. Each program completers serves as a case. Each case study includes the following data sources presented in the table below:

Table 1. Data sources

	Participants	Data sources	Procedures
Qualitative data with case studies	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Fourteen program completers working in Qatari governmental schools • School administrators • Fourteen program completers colleagues • Six parents 	Observation – 1 occasions of each program completer with 2 observers each time, in total 2 sets of observation data for each completer.	Observation method in this study includes a set of data sources including lesson plans, , classroom observation, and student results) Observation data was generated second week of Jan 2023 to first week of Feb 2023
			Each occasion includes the following steps: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • An informal talk with the program completer to have a brief impression of her/his work before the observation • Documents including lesson plans and other relevant materials are obtained. • Classroom observations are conducted with the evaluation sheet • Reviewers’ observation notes • An informal talk communicating with the program completer concerning the feedbacks and advice on improvement
			The reviewers stressed and addressed the progress of the completion on the following occasion. In total, two observations set in order to observe the completer is performance and learning abilities for improvement.
		Interviews	Interview with 14 school administrators
			Interview with six students parents
			Interview with 14 program completers

- One occasion of classroom observation of each program completer, each occasion includes an informal talk with the program completer to have a brief impression of her/his work before the observation and after. Classroom observation rating sheet, and documents including lesson plans, teaching materials and student performance. In the development of the classroom observation-rating sheet, the following steps were followed:

- 1) Multiple rounds of internal analysis have been undertaken by the Study Team (four team members are professional program experts). Other experts conducted expert validation who are seniors working in the program for 10-20 years. Minor revisions were made accordingly regarding the phrasing of items including item 1, 2, 6, 8 and 9.
- 2) Statistical experts to determine the quality and size of the nature of the questionnaire carried out another expert evaluation. Three addressed rounds culminated in scale revision until a final agreement between the study team and experts on the current version were achieved.
- 3) Faculty members who did the interviews conducted translation into Arabic.
- 4) Pilot study was carried out by four previous program completers who worked in public schools, and three professional specialists who supervised the new teachers. One word in Arabic version was revised in item 2 and item 6 each accordingly to make the expression of the items more precise.

Throughout class observations, teacher performance appraisal raters were requested, showing the degree to which she / he displayed her/his skills to the following respects, and using the four-point scale:

1 = “Has little knowledge about the concept/instructional practice”

2 = “Demonstrates fair knowledge and skills about the concept/instructional practice but lacks confidence in using it in class”

3 = “Demonstrates good knowledge and skills about the concept/instructional practice that allows students to use it in class”

4 = “Demonstrates wide knowledge and skills about the concept/instructional practice, and feels very confident in using it in class”

After the observation sessions, interviews with each program completers and their supervisors – subject coordinators were conducted. The pre- and post observation conferences and interviews were conducted in the schools at the convenience of the participants. Each interview lasted 30-60 minutes. The interviews were conducted in Arabic, written and audio-recorded before transcribing and translating to English for content analysis (Kvale & Brinkmann, 2009).

Informal Pre- and post-classroom observation conference talk guidelines were as follows:

Pre-observation Conference:

1. How do you feel about the teaching job in general?
2. How do you prepare the lesson plans usually?
3. What might be some strategies you have used before that were effective?
4. How might your actions enhance student learning?
5. What are you hoping to accomplish with this lesson?
6. What might you see that will let you know you have reached your goal?

Informal Post-observation Conference: Reflecting Conservation

1. How do you think the lesson went? How did you feel?
2. How do you compare the lesson you planned to the lesson you taught?
3. What are some of the things you did to make it go so well?
4. Which of your skills seemed most useful?

5. What learning(s) do you want to take with you to future lessons?
6. The reviewers provide feedbacks and advices for improvement.

Data analysis:

Quantitative data analysis was based on computed descriptive statistics in order to analyze the responses of the panelists. We computed means and standard deviations for each item of the questionnaire and observation-rating sheets.

For the qualitative data, an inductive content analysis technique was conducted to reveal individual responses by defining patterns of communication and inferring meanings via linguistic features in the given contexts (Cohen, Manion, & Morrison, 2013). Through thematic analysis focusing on meaning condensation, an outline of the meanings expressed by the interviewees were coded and categorized into shorter formulations (Kvale & Brinkmann, 2009). Then, initial findings were used to triangulate the survey results and further explore participants’ elaboration of patterns (Kvale & Brinkmann, 2009). In the process of analysis, the interpretation did not only reply on the described events as facts, but more importantly participants’ social discourse that lies behind their words were taken into the consideration of interpretation and patterns identification (Cohen, Manion, & Morrison, 2013).

Quantitative Results:

Demographic segmentation

Case Number	sex	specialty
Case 1	F	Science
Case2	F	Arabic
Case3	F	Arabic
Case4	F	Arabic
Case5	F	PE
Case6	F	PE
Case7	F	Early childhood
Case 8	F	Social Studies
Case 9	F	English
Case 10	F	Islamic Islamic
Case11	F	Science
Case12	M	Social Studies
Case 13	M	PE
Case14	F	Math

The mean and standard deviation were calculated for each item by each observer. The mean is interpreted based on the following criteria.

Reliability of Class Observation Sheet:

Since the classroom observation sheet used by two observers, the inter-rater reliability tests was used to ensure the reliability of this observation sheet. The output results of inter-rater reliability tests presented in the tables below:

Table 1. Correlation coefficient among observers

	Opserver1	Opserver2
Opserver1	1.000	0.701
Opserver2	0.701	1.000

The significant correlation coefficient between observer 1 and observer 2 was 0.701 suggesting a high level of correlation.

Table 2. Reliability test :

Cronbach's Alpha	Cronbach's Alpha Based on Standardized Items	N of items
.818	.821	8

From table 2 below, the value of Cronbach's Alpha based on Standardized Items was .821 indicating a good level of reliability.

Table 3. Intraclass Correlation Coefficient

Intraclass Correlation Coefficient							
	Intraclass Correlation ^b	95% Confidence Interval		F Test with True Value 0			
		Lower Bound	Upper Bound	Value	df1	df2	Sig
Single Measures	.352 ^a	.212	.538	5.343	26	182	<.001
Average Measures	.813 ^c	.683	.903	5.343	26	182	<.001

Based on the value of the average measures in table 3, the **Intraclass Correlation Coefficient** was 0.813, which is considered as a good level of reliability.

Quantitative results:

Table 4: Criteria for interpreting the mean based on the survey scale and responses

The mean and standard deviation were calculated for each item by each observer.

The mean is interpreted based on the following criteria:

Mean range	Interpretation
1.00 - 1.74	Has little knowledge about the concept/instructional practice
1.75 - 2.49	Demonstrates fair knowledge and skills about the concept/instructional practice but lacks confidence in using it in class
2.50- 3.24	Demonstrates good knowledge and skills about the concept/instructional practice that allows students to use it in class
3.25 - 4.00	Demonstrates wide knowledge and skills about the concept/instructional practice, and feels very confident in using it in class

Table 5. Mean and Standard Deviation for each Item of each Observer and for the total.

Item	Observer1		Observer 2		Total	
	Mean	SD	Mean	SD	Mean	SD
1.The teacher was able to provide a variety of opportunities that support student learning and development.	3.36	0.50	3.64	0.50	3.50	0.51
2.The teacher was able to use knowledge of school, family, cultural and community factors that influence the quality of education for all students.	3.29	0.47	3.36	0.74	3.32	0.61
3.The teacher was able to establish a classroom environment of respect and support that provides a culture for learning.	3.71	0.61	3.79	0.43	3.75	0.52
4.The teacher had sufficient content of my professional field.	3.86	0.36	3.57	0.76	3.71	0.60
5.The teacher was able to motivate learners and engage them in critical thinking by teaching a variety of perspectives and concepts.	3.07	0.47	3.29	0.73	3.18	0.61
6.The teacher was able to engage in assessment activities and use the data for instructional decision making and student improvement.	3.00	0.41	3.50	0.52	3.26	0.53
7.The teacher was able to plan integrated and coherent instruction to meet the learning needs of all students.	3.57	0.51	3.50	0.52	3.54	0.51
8.The teacher was able to provide student-centered instruction that is characterized by clarity, variety, and flexibility.	3.21	0.58	3.50	0.52	3.36	0.56
Overall	3.39	0.24	3.55	0.46	3.47	0.37

Based on (14) observed cases by two observers, the mean for each item was calculated for each observer.

From table 5, it was found that, the overall mean is 3.47 (greater than 3.25). Based on criteria in table 4, we can conclude that in general the 14 cases (participants) in the case study demonstrate wide knowledge and skill about the concept/instructional practice, and feels very confident in using it in class.

Results by Male and Female:

Table 6. Mean and Standard Deviation for each Item by Gender.

Item	Female		Male		Total	
	Mean	SD	Mean	SD	Mean	SD
1.The teacher was able to provide a variety of opportunities that support student learning and development.	3.54	0.51	3.25	0.50	3.50	0.51
2.The teacher was able to use knowledge of school, family, cultural and community factors that influence the quality of education for all students.	3.33	0.64	3.25	0.50	3.32	0.61
3.The teacher was able to establish a classroom environment of respect and support that provides a culture for learning.	3.88	0.34	3.00	0.82	3.75	0.52
4.The teacher had sufficient content of my professional field.	3.79	0.51	3.25	0.96	3.71	0.60
5.The teacher was able to motivate learners and engage them in critical thinking by teaching a variety of perspectives and concepts.	3.21	0.59	3.00	0.82	3.18	0.61
6.The teacher was able to engage in assessment activities and use the data for instructional decision making and student improvement.	3.35	0.49	2.75	0.50	3.26	0.53
7.The teacher was able to plan integrated and coherent instruction to meet the learning needs of all students.	3.58	0.50	3.25	0.50	3.54	0.51
8.The teacher was able to provide student-centered instruction that is characterized by clarity, variety, and flexibility.	3.46	0.51	2.75	0.50	3.36	0.56
Overall	3.53	0.33	3.06	0.36	3.47	0.37

From table 6, for Female, it was found that, the total mean for each items is greater than 3.25. Based on criteria in table 4, we can conclude that the 14 cases (participants) in the case study demonstrate wide knowledge and skills about the concept/instructional practice, and feels very confident in using it in class. For male, the total mean for each items falls between (2.50 and 3.24). Based on criteria in table 4, we can conclude that the 14 cases (participants) in the case study demonstrates good knowledge and skills about the concept/instructional practice that allows students to use it in class”

Table 7. Mann-Whitney test results for gender:

Gender	#of observation	Median	Mean Rank	Sum of Ranks	Mann-Whitney U	Z	Sig
Female	24	3.54	15.88	381.00	15	-2.186	0.029
Male	4	3.06	6.25	25.00			

From table (7). There is a significant differences between the median for male and female students on the teaching effectiveness (median for male= 3.06 and the median for female=3.60) With $U=15.00$, $Z= -2.186$ and $p\text{-value}=0.029$. The female demonstrates wide knowledge and skills about the concept/instructional practice, and feels very confident in using it in class, however the male demonstrates good knowledge and skills about the concept/instructional practice, and feels very confident in using it in class”

Results by Field:

Table 8. Mean and Standard Deviation for each Item by field

		Arabic (n=6)	Early Childhood (n=2)	English (n=2)	Islamic (n=2)	Math (n=2)	PE (n=6)	Science (n=4)	Social Studies (n=4)	Total (n=28)
1.The teacher was able to provide a variety of opportunities that support student learning and development.	M	3.67	3.50	3.00	4.00	3.50	3.17	3.50	3.75	3.50
	S.D	0.52	0.71	0.00	0.00	0.71	0.41	0.58	0.50	0.51
2.The teacher was able to use knowledge of school, family, cultural and community factors that influence the quality of education for all students.	M	3.83	3.00	2.50	3.50	3.00	3.33	3.25	3.25	3.38
	S.D	0.41	0.00	0.71	0.71	0.00	0.52	0.96	0.50	0.64
3.The teacher was able to establish a classroom environment of respect and support that provides a culture for learning.	M	4.00	4.00	3.50	4.00	3.50	3.50	4.00	3.50	3.77
	S.D	0.00	0.00	0.71	0.00	0.71	0.84	0.00	0.58	0.51
4.The teacher had sufficient content of my professional field.	M	4.00	3.50	3.00	4.00	4.00	3.33	4.00	3.75	3.73
	S.D	0.00	0.71	1.41	0.00	0.00	0.82	0.00	0.50	0.60
5.The teacher was able to motivate learners and engage them in critical thinking by teaching a variety of perspectives and concepts.	M	3.50	3.00	3.00	3.50	3.00	2.83	2.75	3.75	3.19
	S.D	0.55	0.00	0.00	0.71	0.00	0.41	0.96	0.50	0.63
6.The teacher was able to engage in assessment activities and use the data for instructional decision making and student improvement.	M	3.40	3.50	3.00	3.50	3.00	3.00	3.50	3.25	3.28
	S.D	0.55	0.71	0.00	0.71	0.00	0.63	0.58	0.50	0.54
7.The teacher was able to plan integrated and coherent instruction to meet the learning needs of all students.	M	3.83	3.50	3.00	4.00	3.50	3.33	3.25	3.75	3.54
	S.D	0.41	0.71	0.00	0.00	0.71	0.52	0.50	0.50	0.51
8.The teacher was able to provide student-centered instruction that is characterized by clarity, variety, and flexibility.	M	3.83	3.00	3.00	4.00	3.00	3.00	3.50	3.25	3.42
	S.D	0.41	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.63	0.58	0.50	0.58
Overall	M	3.76	3.38	3.00	3.81	3.50	3.19	3.47	3.53	3.48

	S.D	0.18	0.00	0.35	0.27	0.35	0.34	0.44	0.31	0.38
--	-----	------	------	------	------	------	------	------	------	------

*n is number of observation by 2 observers

Table 8, the total mean for Arabic, Islamic, Math, Science, Social Science and Early Childhood, are greater than 3.55. Based on criteria in table 4, we can conclude that the 14 cases (participants) in the case study demonstrate wide knowledge and skills about the concept/instructional practice, and feels very confident in using it in class. However, the overall means for English and P.E are 3.00 and 3.19 respectively which fall between 2.50 and 3.24 which demonstrate good knowledge and skills about the concept/instructional practice that allows students to use it in class.

Qualitative Data Results:

Multiple sources of qualitative data were generated in the fourteen case studies, including fourteen interviews with the program completers, fourteen interviews with their supervisors, six interviews with their students' parents, pre- and post informal observation conferences, and documents review of lesson plans, teaching materials and student performance. Outcomes of the cross-cases integrating multiple sources of data were reported taking the following structure: firstly, overall evaluation of the program completers regarding their professional knowledge, teaching skills and professional dispositions; secondly, the link between teaching performance and teacher preparation program; thirdly, missing points from teacher preparation program; and fourthly, teaching learning through work.

1. Overall evaluation of the program completers regarding their professional knowledge, teaching skills and professional dispositions:

All the fourteen program completers have confidently self-evaluated their readiness for working as a teacher in the aspects of professional knowledge, teaching skills and professional dispositions. Their supervisors provided evaluation that is even more positive, as they commented on the completers respectively:

Supervisor of Case 1: *"I feel very satisfied about her general educational skills, teaching practices, professional knowledge, professional attitudes, and the teacher's commitment to educational laws and instructions, Also, everyone unanimously agreed that the teacher accepts feedback and constructive criticism and in light of that, she develops herself and improves constantly"*

Teacher of Case1: *"I am satisfied with all of these aspects. I have good lesson planning skills, teaching skills, evaluation skills, and classroom discipline skills. I also have a wide range of modern teaching strategies, especially scientific enquiry, which I use it constantly in science classes. I always prefer to teach science classes inside the laboratory"*.

Teacher of Case 2: *"I evaluate my overall performance in all previous aspects at a reasonable level or, 80%. However, I need more practice and development on the applied and practical side since there are many new and changing things in the school, which helps keep pace with it"*.

Teacher of Case 4: *"I think I am doing excellent and capable of giving, but I feel some tension that sometimes affects my performance"*.

Supervisor of Case 4: *"She accepts guidance. She is keen to attend internal and external professional development sessions, initiated a model lesson"*.

Parent of Case 4: *“I am satisfied with her performance because my daughter loves the subject and returns home memorizes the lesson. However, she is in first grade and is still in the foundation stage”.*

Supervisor of Case 5: *“The teacher is excellent in professional knowledge, and she is very good in teaching skills. She needs more training to become distinguished, and her professional dispositions are excellent”*

Teacher of Case 5: *“I consider myself very good in terms of professional knowledge, teaching skills, and excellent in professional dispositions”.*

Parent of Case 5: *“I thanked the teacher for her performance; my son has a remarkable learning improvement”.*

Supervisor of Case 6: *“Teacher Wadha is rapidly developing. She has high abilities in teaching, lesson planning, and developing her students learning outcomes. She is confident, presents a high teaching performance, accepts directions and implements them correctly (efficiency), planning lessons constructively and adequately”.*

Teacher of Case 6: *“Through self-reflection, there is a noticeable absence of some skills, such as gymnastics and volleyball, because of the situation the country was going through, which affected me practically. The college administration must focus on internships and practical courses that are appropriate and matched with the Ministry of Education”.*

Teacher of Case8: *“The teacher has the appropriate basics of the educational process, classroom management, observing the students to know their levels, determining the appropriate activities for them, and accepting directions for development”.*

Teacher of Case9: *“I am very satisfied with my work performance. I am still working on self-development to acquire more skills that benefit my students”.*

Supervisor of Case13: *“Hussein is a teacher who learns quickly, is responsive, can handle work pressure, and is enthusiastic”.*

Supervisor of Case14: *“The teacher, Abdul Rahman, is a strong addition to the Department of Social Studies, because of his thought and responsibility. He is one of the main teachers who we depend on him in the Department of Social Studies”.*

Supervisor of Case 5: *“The academic teacher's achievements with the students are very good, as an improvement was noticed in the level of her students' performance, as evidenced by the improvement in the students' evaluation, the teacher was praised by the coordinator, especially in her activities and her*

dealings with the students, her use of acting methods, and diversifying the tone of voice to convey the information easily”

Parent of Case 5: *“The teacher’s achievements are very good with the students, as evidenced by their improved knowledge of letters and writing, their love and motivation for studying and learning*

Supervisor of Case 9: *“the teacher has developed her professional skills in terms of demonstrating a commitment to learning and diversity and meeting students’ differentiations, building rapport and serve as a strong role model to peers, colleagues and learners, displaying effective communication skills (oral and written) in all settings; and demonstrating professional competence and conduct”.*

Supervisor of Case 10: *“she is a good teacher who is sensitive to individual differences between students”.*

Supervisor of Case 14: *“The teacher is distinguished by his depth of knowledge and professional commitment. He also possesses the skills that qualify him to be one of the distinguished teachers, due to his keenness on self-professional development and his acceptance of directives.*

2. Evaluate the teacher’s current performance at work regarding making academic and learning gains with the students. Their supervisors provided evaluation that is even more positive, as they commented on the completers respectively:

Teacher of Case 1: *“ My students' performance in science had improved, and their test scores had been improving continually. My students love science subjects, do the activities and show positive interaction in science classes because I constantly provide them with activities they love, use technology in science classes, and constantly support them with appropriate reinforcement and encouragement. I encourage my students to make scientific projects and models. I keep projects in a special corner in the science laboratory at the school, and I intend to hold a science exhibition at the end of the academic year”.*

Supervisor of Case 1: *“One of the most important academic teacher's achievements is the improvement of her students' scores in science, and the development of their attitudes towards learning science subjects. They attributed the reason for this to the positive relationship between the teacher and her students, and her students' love for her. The teacher constantly reinforces her students. She always gives them gifts to enhance their positive behavior. These reinforcements reflected positively on the progress of her students' achievement in science. ”*

Teacher of Case 2: *“I am satisfied with what I have presented to my students since the beginning of the year. I was keen to establish reading and writing skills, and I noticed significant improvements in the student's grades, in the students' interaction in the class, in the short tests, dictation, and writing”.*

Teacher of Case 4: *“Students respond to me. After two months, they responded to me. Within two months, students improved their writing, and this was achieved by putting them in a suitable group, providing exercises and various activities and focusing on them”.*

Supervisor of Case 4: *“Because she is a new teacher, she was given one class. She participates well in school and shows commitment towards her teaching performance. Students love her. Her communication with students and parents is good, and she supports them”*.

Parent of Case 4: *“Her grade in the evaluation of the Ministry is fantastic. She got a high score. She only missed one and a half points, which is evidence that as a teacher, she is excellent.*

Teacher of Case 5: *“Academic achievements are good with students due to the short time I spent with them, but there is a noticeable improvement in the levels of reading and writing letters and improving their speaking skill”*.

Teacher of Case 5: *“The teacher is evaluated on the items of the classroom questionnaire. He also reviewed this questionnaire to know the most important items, to be familiar with these items, and to reflect them in his performance and on the results of the students. He added value in the end-of-semester exams, in addition to preparing appropriate activities for the categories of students”*.

Supervisor of Case 9: *“The teacher shows a noticeable improvement in applying new skills and applications she has trained on. She assesses her students learning process through both direct and indirect measures (e.g., quizzes, exams, summative and formative assessments, and giving and receiving students’ feedback)”*.

Teacher of Case 9: *“I can see my performance is good. My evidence is my students, in one of the classes I teach, have highest scores in their academic achievement among the fourth year students in school”*.

Teacher of Case 10: *“Graduates of Qatar University have the ability to keep pace with modern technological developments and the experience of preparing lessons”*.

Supervisor of Case 10: *“The teacher achieved a number of academic achievements by raising the academic achievement of his students and obtaining advanced positions in scientific research competitions.*

Parent of Case 14: *“I noticed a significant improvement in my son's level and an increase in his love for the subject through his relationship with the teacher, and he became keener to participate in research and competitions.*

3. Link between teaching performance and teacher preparation program:

The program completers interviewed were generally pleased with the lessons learned from their teacher training program and could relate the benefits of the program to their regular teaching practice. The key benefits of the curriculum include ideas, which have helped to explain teaching and learning, a broad variety of teaching methods and skills for teaching and microteaching. As they expressed:

Supervisor of Case 1 : *“They evaluate graduates from College of Education QU as the best in terms of professional knowledge, overall teaching abilities, and professionalism. They mentioned that the teachers graduated from Qatar University possess a solid knowledge background in their specialties, and they have a lot of teaching and evaluation skills, and modern strategies. They praised their desire and*

motivation to develop themselves by attending training workshops held by the Ministry of Education or any other institutions”

Teacher of Case 1: *“Certainty and without doubt, there is a very strong relationship between my current performance and what I learned and gained of knowledge and experiences during my studies at the university”*.

Teacher of Case 2: *“I benefited from everything studied in the teacher preparation program and applied it in my work. It helped me feel confident about work and competently engage with the new environment. The strategies, skills, and teaching methods studied in the program supported my work performance, as I presented all the tasks previously, from planning lessons and explanations and strategies application”*.

Teacher of Case 4: *“Throughout learning at the university, I gained the skills and how to deal with children in the first stage, especially in the Child Development course; I acquired skills and the ability to apply them in class, in addition to the Classroom Management course”*.

Parent of Case 4: *“Graduates of Qatar University are definitely the best. I feel satisfied with the graduates, and their performance is excellent. They are competencies, even diplomas. Their level is great”*.

Supervisor of Case 5 : *“She is a distinguished teacher who has the general ability to teach, creative ideas, and high skills in means and activities”*

Teacher of Case 5: *“ The field training was a good opportunity to deal with the school environment, including the administration, teachers and students interaction, before engaging in the reality of the actual work, as it was a preparatory stage for the work”*.

Teacher of Case 6: *“For me, the program was full of courses that I did not benefit from at work now”*.
“The thing I benefited from most was the last course, which was the field training (the internship)”.

Supervisor of Case8 : *“Graduates of the College of Education are characterized by professional knowledge and have sound basics in teaching methods and classroom management, where we do not face any difficulty, as the directions are compared to graduates of other colleges, as they need continuous follow-up, guidance, intensification of training workshops, explanation of strategies and the mechanism of their application, and this takes effort and time on the coordinator and school administration.*

Supervisor of Case 9: “*graduates from College of Education, Qatar University are skilled. However, here are some concerns such as: increase the field training credits for new teachers in agreement with the administration of the hosting schools, train new student teachers on how to design lesson plans according to the school forms; and train the student teachers for a period of not less than one semester*”.

Teacher of Case 9 : “*The thing that most influenced my performance was the field-training program in the last year, as it prepared me well in managing time and accepting the sudden changes that may occur in schools.*

Teacher of Case 10: “*The education program at Qatar University helped me acquire academic and professional knowledge*”.

Teacher of Case 12: “*Qatar University graduates are highly qualified before and after employment*”.

Supervisor of Case 12 : “*Qatar University graduates are strong and important supporters of the Ministry of Education. A graduate of Qatar University is comparable and distinguished from his peers from other universities. Graduates have a passion for developing performance and increasing knowledge*”.

4 Similarly, all interviewed supervisors and students’ parents also attribute the satisfying performance of the program completers to the effectiveness of the teacher preparation program.

In particular, the supervisors and parents compared teachers graduated from College of Education, Qatar University and teachers from other backgrounds, as cited by them.

My daughter loves science classes; her achievement is high in science. She does science homework by her own self without asking for help from anyone, with desire and enthusiasm. My daughter understands the content of the science book and does not ask me for any help at home. (Parent of Case 1)

The teacher is distinguished by her high knowledge of the scientific material, as she takes into account individual differences, and her material is organized, tidy, and sequential, she is very positive with her students. (Parent of Case 10)

Completely satisfied with the level of knowledge and skills of the teacher and the extent of his keeping up with modern teaching methods. (Parent of Case14)

4. Missing points from teacher preparation program

Interviewed program completers and supervisors identified two major missing points from their teaching preparation program. One completer mentioned the confidence in professional knowledge and skills as she said;

Teacher of Case 1: “*I found myself knowing how to behave in all educational situations. There was nothing strange, because I learned how to deal with sudden circumstances at the university, with the exception of what I found of a difference between the lesson plan approved by the Ministry of Education and the lesson plan approved by the College of Education at Qatar University. I hope that coordination would take place between the Ministry of Education and the College of Education at Qatar University to unify the lesson plan. I also suggest increasing focus on the practical aspects that are directly related to the actual reality in schools of Qatar*”.

Teacher of Case 2: *“Some aspects need more training, and it is suggested to increase the duration of the practical training to an academic year or two semesters for field training”*.

“Some aspects of the program need more explanation and clarification, such as teacher competencies. I knew the term, but I needed to learn how to use effectively it or what it means, except after my work in schools and the coordinator's help clarifying”.

Supervisor of Case 4 : *“Some former internship students use unacceptable and non-pedagogical vocabulary, need to learn their duties, adhere to the dress code, and be leaders in general”*. Graduates: *Outstanding, there are creatives, but some need help. The majority need knowledge and support on how to organize the lesson”*.

Teacher of Case 5 : *“There is a gap between what has been trained in field training and the reality of work in kindergartens in terms of preparing for the lesson and the sequence of presenting the lesson”*.

Teacher of Case 6: *“There is a lack of content related to the practical side, the gradual training in practice and performance evaluation.*

Supervisor of Case 9: *“She had lacked of some educational competencies, such as, designing an effective lesson plans and formulating objectives due to the reason that she learned the course in Arabic at Qatar University”*.

Teacher of Case 9: *“Students need to be aware of all the roles that teacher plays in the school such as activity classes and planning for them- remedial lessons- communication with parents- internal and external competitions. All of these matters must be joint program between the Ministry of education and the university. The Ministry of Education should send plans for activities and values. Then, Qatar University gives each major with the appropriate activity and trains students to do it. This step makes it easier for university students to know the tasks required from them”*.

“I can't relate my current performance at work to the pre-service teaching preparation program. As I am teacher of secondary school and I was placed to teach primary levels, there is a big difference in the preparation of my plans and the way of dealing with students”.

Supervisor of Case13: *“The teacher needs a lot of guidance in the first year, especially since the students in physical education do not receive any practical training in wrestling and handball.*

In reaction to the missing aspects, completers mentioned that there is a need to have practical training since the first year at university, and does not have to be in the last semester of the fourth year. This point was also mentioned in the interviews with the supervisors stated that the program completers need more training in schools before graduating. In addition, Ministry of Education and the College of Education at Qatar University need to unify the lesson plan.

Limitations and difficulties of the case study

While this case study provided evidence on the impact of pre-service student teacher program from the perspectives of program completers, employers and observation of their practices, the results remain provisional due to a few limitations and difficulties as follows:

- Classroom observation are conducted by the faculty members; whom have many burdens that may prevent them from quickly performing the task required of them.

- A larger population of participants may provide more variation of the practices.
- Some school principals do not allow the observers from the university to attend the class directly although they have a permit from the Ministry of Education and Higher Education.
- Teachers fear the school administration will pass us the results of their students' achievement.
- In terms of interviews, it did not meet the required purpose and there was no good response from interviewees, as some of whom simply answered one word to the question.
- There are faculty members who failed to manage classroom observation and were followed up for more than three weeks.
- In order to increase the efficiency of the standard, a full-time team must be used in addition to faculty members in order to expand the scope of data collection.